

To Accreditation Council
Of the Eurasian Center for
Accreditation and Quality assurance
In Higher education and health care

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF THE ASSESSMENT
OF THE LIMITED LIABILITY COMPANY
"KAZAKH ORDER" BADGE OF HONOR "
"RESEARCH INSTITUTE OF EYE DISEASES"
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (RESIDENCY
SPECIALTIES) IN MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

period of external expert evaluation: 12.05.-13.05.2021

Almaty, 2021

CONTENT






	List of symbols and abbreviations	3
1.	EEC composition	4
2.	General part of the final report of the EEC	6
2.1	Presentation of LLP "Kazakh Order" Badge of Honor "Scientific Institute of Eye Diseases" (KIED) and the educational residency programme 7R113700 "Ophthalmology, including children's"	6
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	7
2.3	Analysis of the Residency Study Programme Self-Assessment Report 7R113700 "Ophthalmology, including children's "	7
3.	Description of the stages of external expert evaluation and conclusion	8
4.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment educational residency programme 7R113700 "Ophthalmology, including children's "KIED and an overview of the strengths for each standard	15
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational residency programme 7R113700 "Ophthalmology, including children's "KIED	28
6.	Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council	28
7.	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational residency programme 7R113700 "Ophthalmology, including children's "KIED for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards	29
8.	Attachment 2. List of documents studied by members of the EEC in the framework of specialized accreditation	30



LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:

GPA	Weighted average assessment of the level of educational achievements of a student in the chosen specialty
ECTS	European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System
PBL	Problem based learning
TBL	Team based training
AUP	Administrative and management personnel
BD (O)	Basic disciplines (training)
SAC	State Attestation Commission
Civil Defense and Emergencies	Civil defense and emergencies
SCES	State compulsory education standard
DS&HR	Department of Science and Human Resources
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care
FSA	Final state attestation
IC	Individual curriculum (resident)
KIED	Kazakh Institute of Eye Diseases
CVI	Coronavirus infection
CoC	Component of choice
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MEO	Medical education organization
EMC	Educational and methodical council
IAAR	Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating
STP	Scientific and technical programme
NCIE	National Center for Independent Examination
OJK	Ophthalmological journal of Kazakhstan
EP	Educational programme
DPE	Department of Postgraduate Education
OSCE	Objective structured clinical examination
IC	Intermediate certification
PD (O)	Profile disciplines (training)
WC	Working curricula
QMS	Quality Management System
IWR	Independent work of a resident
SC	Simulation center
IWRUST	Independent work of a resident under the supervision of a teacher
TC	Typical curricula
ERWS	Educational and research work of residents
AC	Academic Council
PDC	Professional development cycles

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 14 dated 04.16.2021, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct institutional accreditation and accreditation of the educational residency programme "Ophthalmology, incl. children's "KIED in the following composition:

	<p>Chairperson of the External Expert Commission ZHANTELIEVA LYAZZAT ASANOVNA, MD, DSc, Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Research, JSC Scientific Center of Urology named after B.U.Dzharbusynova "tel .: + 77073762818, e-mail: zhantelieva@gmail.com...</p>
	<p>Foreign expert ZAKIROVA GUZEL ZAKIROVNA, Ph.D., Associate Professor of the Department of Ophthalmology, Kazan State Medical University, ophthalmologist at the Children's Republican Clinical Hospital of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Tatarstan, tel .: +79372880618, e-mail: guzel-@list.ru</p>
	<p>National academic expert ZHANKALOVA ZULFIYA MEYRKHANOVNA, MD, DSc, Professor of the Department of General Health Problems No. 1, Asfendiyarov KazNMU, tel .: 87026043940, e-mail: zulfiya-zhankalo@mail.ru</p>
	<p>National Academic Expert (online) SEMYONOVA YULIA MIKHAILOVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Neurology, Ophthalmology and ENT, NJSC "Semey Medical University" tel .: 87011508293, e-mail: yumsem@mail.ru</p>
	<p>Expert - representative of employers GULNARA ZARKYNBEKOVNA KALIBEKOVA, Doctor PhD, Master of Public Health, Deputy Chief Physician of the SPE on REM "City Polyclinic No. 10" tel.: + 77057731875 e-mail: kalibekovaG75@mail.ru</p>

	<p>Expert - Resident Representative IMADIEVA AISHOLPAN, resident doctor 3 years of study in the specialty "Ophthalmology, including children's", NUO "KRMU", tel .: +7 775 4494552, e-mail: aishollpan@mail.ru</p>
	<p>ECAQA Observer SARSENBAYEVA DARIYABANU BULATOVNA, Head of the International Department, «Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" tel .: +77771471726, e-mail: info@ecaqa.org</p>

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director general No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an institutional assessment of KIED for compliance with the Standards of Institutional Accreditation medical postgraduate organizations of ECAQA, recommendations of the EEC on the further improvement of the educational activities of KIED in the field of postgraduate education.

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 LLP "Kazakh Order" Badge of Honor "Scientific Research Institute of Eye Diseases"

In 1933, in the city of Alma-Ata, by the Decree of the Council of People's Commissars of the KAZSSR No. 858/29 of October 21, the Regional Scientific Research Practical Ophthalmological Institute was organized on the basis of the Alma-Ata Eye Hospital, which was later renamed the Scientific Research Institute of Eye Diseases ".

In 1983, the Kazakh Research Institute of Eye Diseases was awarded the Order of the Badge of Honor. On August 16, 2019, based on the Certificate of State Registration, the status of KIED was changed to LLP -[limited partnership](#)...

To cover the population of the northern and central regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan with highly qualified ophthalmological care, a KIED branch was created in 2010 on the basis of a branch of the Railway Hospital in Astana, and in 2015 the branch acquired its own building at the address: Nursultan, 16 Zhenis Ave. / one. In 2018, KIED opened its branch in Shymkent, which currently includes a functional diagnostics room, a day hospital, a 24-hour hospital, and a paid department. In 2014, KIED successfully passed the accreditation of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Committee for Control of Medical and Pharmaceutical Activities ([Accreditation certificate No. KZ44VEG00001428 dated December 2, 2014](#)) In 2020, KIED was re-accredited by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan as a subject of scientific and scientific-technical activities ([Series MK No. 006191 dated 06/25/2020.](#))

On May 02, 2013, by Order of KIED JSC No. 7/1 l/s-n, a postgraduate department was created, which on December 15, 2014 (order of KIED JSC No. 219-p) was transformed into a department of postgraduate education, the main tasks of which are training students of residency and advanced training cycles. Training of residents in KIED is carried out in accordance with the State License of the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 06, 2011 No. 0142684 under the state educational order for engaging in educational activities in the specialty "Ophthalmology, including children's". Currently, in accordance with license no.KZ33LAA00016970 dated September 13, 2019. In 2015, KIED introduced a credit training technology.

The ophthalmological school, formed at the institute for several decades, is the leading one in the Republic of Kazakhstan. From its very foundation, one of the priority areas of KIED activity has been professional development and retraining of ophthalmologists. In the last 5 years alone, 68 ophthalmologists have been trained on the basis of KIED within the framework of residency, 632 ophthalmologists and 333 paramedics [underwent advanced training](#). The quality of training and the demand for residency graduates is determined by the high level of their employment (100%).

34 teachers work in KIED LLP, including 8 doctors of sciences, 4 professors, 17 candidates of sciences, 1 PhD doctor, which is 76.5% of the staff number of teachers.

The educational process uses 1 interactive system, 6 modern computers with Internet access, there is a simulation room. The general fund of the library numbers 9407 copies, of which 5323 are specialized literature: these are books, dissertations, abstracts, periodicals, access to electronic information resources is provided.

KIED has agreements on long-term bilateral cooperation with the RSE on the REM "Institute of General Genetics and Cytology", NUO "Kazakh-Russian Medical University", "Kazakh National Medical University. S. Asfendiyarov "and the Republican State Enterprise" Scientific Center for Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery "of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as with research organizations from near and far abroad in the field of education and science.

The main task of training residents in the specialty "ophthalmology, including children's" is the formation of professional competence in the field of various ophthalmopathology.

Thus, KIED is an innovation-oriented and socially responsible scientific center, a leader in the Republic of Kazakhstan in the multi-level training of competitive Health care professionals in the field of ophthalmology through the implementation of a competence-oriented model of medical education with the wide involvement of domestic and foreign scientists and a constant increase in scientific potential.

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

In 2016, KIED passed a specialized ([Certificate SA No. 001](#)) accreditation at the Independent Kazakhstani Agency for Quality Assurance in Education.

2.3 Analysis of the KIED Institutional Self-Assessment Report for compliance Institutional accreditation standards medical organizations of postgraduate education

Preparation for KIED institutional accreditation was carried out on the basis of [order No. 59-p dated January 28, 2021](#) ("On the establishment of a Steering Committee and working groups for the passage of institutional and specialized accreditation of LLP").

Self-assessment report educational programme is presented on 83 pages of the main text, of which there are no attachments, electronic versions of documents are presented by the link in GoogL Disk 41.

The report is characterized by responses to the criteria of 9 accreditation standards, structuredness taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as internal consistency of information. The report is accompanied by an accompanying a letter signed by the Director general of KIED Aldasheva N.A., confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the KIED representative responsible for the self-assessment of educational programmes A.B.Doshakanova, head of the postgraduate education department.

A working group of 28 people, including 8 residents of 1-3 years of study, headed by the chairperson, MD Aldasheva N.A. Some work was done to prepare the self-assessment report: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staffs, educational resources, dynamics of development from the date of the previous accreditation in 2016 were analyzed, the necessary information was collected in accordance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) medical educational institutions of ECAQA (hereinafter referred to as accreditation standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report.

All standards show actual practice KIED for training residents in the specialty "Ophthalmology, including children's ", taking into account the beginning of the admission of students in 2018, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. In self-assessment report description fairly completed and updated in term of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on the selection and admission, the results of training, the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development plans and improvement, etc.

Conclusion on each of the 9 accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified in the course of introspection and development prospects for the specialty.

Thus, the self-assessment report of the accredited KIED residency study programme contains objective, detailed, structured information on all activities in accordance with ECAQA accreditation standards, and the university made the appropriate corrections in the report at the expert evaluation stage.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work on the institutional assessment of KIED was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of The Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care" No. 5 dated February 17, 2017) and according to the programme and schedule approved on 05/02/2021 by the Director general of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed by Director General N.A. Aldasheva.

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited organization, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with residents, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questioning teachers and residents, reviewing resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, the study of regulatory and educational-methodological documents both before the visit to KIED, and during the visit.

The KIED team ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

N o.	FULL NAME.	Position
Trainees		
1.	Asan Elnur Myrzakurimuly	resident

2.	Asan Abilgayyr Myrzakurimuly	Resident
3.	Rasulieva Meruert Kanatkyzy	resident
4.	Berikbay Gulzat Talgatkyzy	resident
5.	Sultanbaeva Zhansaya Temirbolatovna	resident
6.	Shaikenova Asiya Dulatovna	resident
7.	Ushimov Almaz Zhanbolatuly	resident
8.	Ruslanuly Kairat	resident
Residency graduates		
9.	Kanatbekova Asel Kanatbekovna	graduate
10.	Shubina Anna Shubina Anna	graduate
11.	Mukhambetova (Kazangapova) Aliya	graduate
12.	Asainova Makpal	graduate
13.	Tukeshev Kuanysh	graduate
14.	Kalshabekov Alibi	graduate
15.	Malyarova Oksana	graduate
Employers		
16.	Doszhanova B.S.	Chief Physician of the Zhambyl Regional Ophthalmological Center
17.	Musatayeva A.A.	Chief physician of LLP Assistance Company "Medi-Service"
18.	Yun O.L.	Chief physician of the "Ophthalmological Center Botabekova T.K."
19.	Shubaeva A.T. Shubaeva A.T.	Head dep. SPE on REM "Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital"
20.	Magzumova D.	Passed advanced training
21.	Gabdulgazizova S.	Passed advanced training
22.	Tleubaev K.A.	Passed advanced training
23.	Irgaibaeva G.A.	Passed advanced training
24.	Radzhapova E.	Passed advanced training
Faculty		
25.	Stepanova I.S.	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Senior Lecturer of DPE
26.	Bulgakova A.A.	Candidate of Medical Sciences, teacher of educational institutions
27.	Aubakirova A.S.	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of Department
28.	Isergepova B.I.	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Deputy Director General for Science

The sequence of the visit during May 12-13, 2021 is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center and in the annex to this report.

An interview was held with 4 teachers, 15 residents, of whom 8 are continuing their studies, 7 are graduates of residency, with 5 cadets who have undergone advanced training by 4 employers (representatives of practical health care). The experience and authority of KIED in the field of postgraduate and additional education shows the demand for graduates and educational programmes of continuous professional development (CPD) by medical organizations in all regions of Kazakhstan.

Interviews with teachers, as providers of the residency program, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational program, since the main developer of programs and educational and methodological documentation is the **department of postgraduate**

education, and teachers are more involved in the practical training of residents and mentoring. In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts received an opinion on the personnel policy and approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation.

In order to validate the performance of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with 8 residents on the zoom platform. Experts asked questions about satisfaction with training at NSCS, sufficient time for supervising patients, work in Damumed with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents who need it, participation in "Journal Clubs", availability of international databases professional literature data. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that KIED has good educational resources, image and international connections, at the same time, residents would like more independence in patient management.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research and development, funding, demonstrated proficiency in English when answering questions from a foreign expert, Ph. Sci., Associate Professor Zakirova G.Z. The experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents-checklists, results of a questionnaire survey of residents).

An online interview with 4 employers of KIED alumni was conducted and included such questions as: knowledge of the organization's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the work of KIED advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc.

A review of resources showed that the KIED clinical base (main institute and polyclinic), available for review at the time of the external visit, meets the goals and objectives of the corresponding educational programmes, since it has 281 beds, of which 193 in Almaty, Nur-Sultan - 77 and Shymkent - 11 a sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment, a simulation room, and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and curators (mentors) provide quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

The experts studied the documentation for the educational programme₃₀ at the link [Googledisk_ /](#), which confirmed the compliance with the accreditation standards, including documentation of teachers and resident mentors and at the request of EEC members.

Then a meeting of the EEC members took place following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC began to design the final report of the EEC.

A meeting of the EEC members was held. The EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. The experts individually completed the "Institutional quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the KIED for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the postgraduate education sector were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

Chairperson of the EEC, Doctor of Medical Sciences Zhanteleeva L.A. a final open vote on recommendations to improve the institutional performance of KIED and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council were held. Then the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment in the framework of institutional accreditation.

Results of the survey.

The ECAQA observer conducted an online survey of residents and teachers on the resource from May 10-12, 2021 <https://webanketa.com/...>

Residents survey results:

The total number of responding residents - 13... Of these, 7.7% are residents of the 1st year of study, 15.4% are residents of the 2nd year of study, and 77% are residents of the 3rd year of study.

Based on the results of the survey, this institute will be recommended as an educational organization - 92.31% fully agree, and 7.69% partially. The fact that programme managers and teachers are aware of the problems associated with learning - 92.3% strongly agree, 7.69% partially agree.

84.62% of residents, partially 7.69%, are completely satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, classrooms of this educational organization, at the same time, 7.69% are completely dissatisfied. Fully satisfied with the provision of educational literature - 61.54%, partially - 30.77%, but 7.7% did not give an answer. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - to this question 92.31% answered that they completely agree.

More than a third of the respondents (38.46%) are engaged in R&D under the guidance of a teacher, 23.1% have just started planning the implementation of R&D, but 7.69% each either have not decided on the topic of R&D or the teacher has not suggested the resident to engage in science, and 15.38% of residents have no desire to engage in research and development.

Fully (61.54%) and partially (30.77%) are satisfied with the library fund of the KIED. All respondents were satisfied with the organization of teaching (amount of time for practical training, location of seminars, topics of seminars). According to 100% of respondents, there is sufficient time for practical training (supervision of patients, clinical rounds, clinical reviews, assistance during operations). More than 92% are satisfied with the schedule of training sessions in the disciplines of the educational programme. Teachers in the classroom often use active and interactive teaching methods - 92.3% answered. More than 84.6% of respondents answered that teachers regularly provide feedback (listen to your opinion, conduct mini-questionnaires, work on mistakes).

According to the responses of 53.85% of residents, it was found that a seminar is held once a week. And the second part of the respondents (46.15%) answered that the seminars are held 2-3 times a week.

100% of residents are sure that this educational organization allows them to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the specialty chosen by the residents. More than 92% describe clinical training as excellent.

The teacher (mentor, curator) of this educational organization is an example for residents -100% answered that they completely agree with this.

100% of the respondents believe that they are provided with a sufficient number of patients for supervision or assistance during operations.

The majority (76.92%) of the respondents believe that the accreditation of an educational institution and educational programmes is an important and necessary mechanism for ensuring the quality of education in residency, the rest believe that there are more serious mechanisms for ensuring quality or doubt the answer.

Almost all the tools used by the external expert commission are important in the opinion of the respondents and allow drawing conclusions about the appropriate conditions for the high-quality implementation of the educational programme in ophthalmology.

Conclusions: with their responses, residents are fully supportive of the institute and are satisfied with the resources and teaching methods. At the same time, the KIED identified an area for improvement, namely, conducting scientific work by residents, strengthening feedback with residents on the results of practical and seminars, improving the library fund of the institute in the context of the residency programme in ophthalmology.

Results of the questionnaire survey of KIED teachers

The ECAQA observer, as part of the external assessment programme, conducted a form questionnaire on May 12, which included 22 questions, allowing to draw conclusions about the attitude of teachers to the organization of the educational process and identify existing problems.

The total number of teachers on the list is 21. The total number of respondents is 21, including those with up to 5 years of experience - 4.8%, up to 10 years - 28.6%, over 10 years - 66.7%.

Fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process 85.7%, partially - 9.5%, no answer - 4.8% (1 person). Ethics is respected at KIED and the chain of command is in full agreement 100%. 95.2% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace, partially 4.8%. The organization has an opportunity for career growth and competence development for teachers - 95.2% fully agree, 4.8% partially.

In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research work - 100% completely agree. I am satisfied with the salary, 76.2% agree, 19% disagree.

76.2% of the respondents are fully satisfied with the work of the personnel department, 9.5% are partially satisfied, no answer is 14.3%.

A third of the respondents underwent advanced training during the last year - 28.6%, more than 3 years ago - 57.1% and more than 5 years ago - 9.5%, but 1 person answered that he did not remember when he raised their qualifications (4.8%).

The microclimate in the team is considered satisfactory by 95.2% of the respondents. More than 95% completely agree that they can realize themselves as professionals, and 4.8% - partially.

Students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training programme, 95.2% fully agree, and 4.8% partially.

The execution of applications for the purchase of methodological and didactic materials, office equipment, stationery to ensure the educational process in the organization is considered timely - 100% of the respondents. The educational organization supports participation in conferences (international, republican): payment of travel, travel, registration fee is more than 66%, and 4.8% did not apply for this to the management, at the same time 33.3% did not give an answer.

All respondents (100%) fully agree that residents have free access to patients and resources of the institute. In a practical lesson, teachers provide students primarily with syllabuses (76.2%), control and measuring instruments (71.4%), monographs (33.3%), an educational journal (71.4%), case studies (14.3%).

The level of prior training of residents upon admission to training programmes is fully satisfied by 23.8% of the respondents, partially - 57.1%, at the same time, 9.5% completely disagree, 9.5% did not answer.

About the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 71.4% know that such programmes exist, at the same time they doubt the answer and do not know about it 19%. Almost 81% of the respondents note that the organization's management listens to teachers with regard to questions about the educational process, research and development, clinical work, sometimes - 4.8%, did not answer this question 14.3%.

When teaching residents, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often the analysis of situational tasks (90.5%), oral questioning and analysis of the topic (90.5% and 95.2%, respectively), work in small groups (57.1%), analysis of tests (85.7%), interactive training (81%), less often problem-oriented training (52.4%). At the same time, lectures are still read (33%), although this is not provided for in the residency programme.

Fully 95.2% agree that this survey will be useful for developing recommendations for improving the university and master's degree programmes, 4.8% partially agree with this.

conclusions: The survey showed the presence of a healthy microclimate in the organization, as well as the fact that the majority of the interviewed teachers are satisfied with the organization of the educational process, the attitude of the management to the teachers of the institute, however, the respondents are not entirely satisfied with the previous level of preparation of applicants for admission to the residency programme. At the same time, areas for improvement were identified: professional

development of teachers in pedagogy, methods of teaching in residency. An observer from ECAQA on 12.05.2021 conducted an online survey of residents on the resource [https://webanketa.com/...](https://webanketa.com/)

Residents survey results:

The total number of responding residents - 13... Of these, 7.7% are residents of the 1st year of study, 15.4% are residents of the 2nd year of study, and 77% are residents of the 3rd year of study.

Based on the results of the survey, this institute will be recommended as an educational organization - 92.31% fully agree, and 7.69% partially. The fact that programme managers and teachers are aware of the problems associated with learning - 92.3% strongly agree, 7.69% partially agree.

84.62% of residents, partially 7.69%, are completely satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, classrooms of this educational organization, at the same time, 7.69% are completely dissatisfied. Fully satisfied with the provision of educational literature - 61.54%, partially - 30.77%, but 7.7% did not give an answer. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - to this question 92.31% answered that they completely agree.

More than a third of the respondents (38.46%) are engaged in R&D under the guidance of a teacher, 23.1% have just started planning the implementation of R&D, but 7.69% each either have not decided on the topic of R&D or the teacher has not suggested the resident to engage in science, and 15.38% of residents have no desire to engage in research and development.

Fully (61.54%) and partially (30.77%) are satisfied with the library fund of the KIED. All respondents were satisfied with the organization of teaching (amount of time for practical training, location of seminars, topics of seminars). According to 100% of respondents, there is sufficient time for practical training (supervision of patients, clinical rounds, clinical reviews, assistance during operations). More than 92% are satisfied with the schedule of training sessions in the disciplines of the educational programme. Teachers in the classroom often use active and interactive teaching methods - 92.3% answered. More than 84.6% of respondents answered that teachers regularly provide feedback (listen to your opinion, conduct mini-questionnaires, work on mistakes).

According to the responses of 53.85% of residents, it was found that a seminar is held once a week. And the second part of the respondents (46.15%) answered that the seminars are held 2-3 times a week.

100% of residents are sure that this educational organization allows them to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the specialty chosen by the residents. More than 92% describe clinical training as excellent.

The teacher (mentor, curator) of this educational organization is an example for residents -100% answered that they completely agree with this.

100% of the respondents believe that they are provided with a sufficient number of patients for supervision or assistance during operations.

The majority (76.92%) of the respondents believe that the accreditation of an educational institution and educational programmes is an important and necessary mechanism for ensuring the quality of education in residency, the rest believe that there are more serious mechanisms for ensuring quality or doubt the answer.

Almost all the tools used by the external expert commission are important in the opinion of the respondents and allow making conclusions about the quality of the educational process.

Conclusions: with their responses, residents are fully supportive of the institute and are satisfied with the resources and teaching methods. At the same time, the KIED identified an area for improvement, namely, conducting scientific work by residents, strengthening feedback with residents on the results of practical and seminars, improving the library fund of the institute in the context of the residency programme in ophthalmology.

Results of the questionnaire survey of KIED teachers

The ECAQA observer, as part of the external assessment programme, conducted a form questionnaire on May 12, which included 22 questions, allowing to draw conclusions about the attitude of teachers to the organization of the educational process and identify existing problems.

The total number of teachers on the list is 21. The total number of respondents is 21, including those with up to 5 years of experience - 4.8%, up to 10 years - 28.6%, over 10 years - 66.7%.

Fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process 85.7%, partially - 9.5%, no answer - 4.8% (1 person). Ethics is respected at KIED and the chain of command is in full agreement 100%. 95.2% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace, partially 4.8%. The organization has an opportunity for career growth and competence development for teachers - 95.2% fully agree, 4.8% partially.

In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research work - 100% completely agree. I am satisfied with the salary, 76.2% agree, 19% disagree.

76.2% of the respondents are fully satisfied with the work of the personnel department, 9.5% are partially satisfied, no answer is 14.3%.

A third of the respondents underwent advanced training during the last year - 28.6%, more than 3 years ago - 57.1% and more than 5 years ago - 9.5%, but 1 person answered that he did not remember when he raised their qualifications (4.8%).

The microclimate in the team is considered satisfactory by 95.2% of the respondents. More than 95% completely agree that they can realize themselves as professionals, and 4.8% - partially.

Students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training programme, 95.2% fully agree, and 4.8% partially.

The execution of applications for the purchase of methodological and didactic materials, office equipment, stationery to ensure the educational process in the organization is considered timely - 100% of the respondents. The educational organization supports participation in conferences (international, republican): payment of travel, travel, registration fee is more than 66%, and 4.8% did not apply for this to the management, at the same time 33.3% did not give an answer.

All respondents (100%) fully agree that residents have free access to patients and resources of the institute. In a practical lesson, teachers provide students primarily with syllabuses (76.2%), control and measuring instruments (71.4%), monographs (33.3%), an educational journal (71.4%), case studies (14.3%).

The level of prior training of residents upon admission to training programmes is fully satisfied by 23.8% of the respondents, partially - 57.1%, at the same time, 9.5% completely disagree, 9.5% did not answer.

About the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 71.4% know that such programmes exist, at the same time they doubt the answer and do not know about it 19%. Almost 81% of the respondents note that the organization's management listens to teachers with regard to questions about the educational process, research and development, clinical work, sometimes - 4.8%, did not answer this question 14.3%.

When teaching residents, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often the analysis of situational tasks (90.5%), oral questioning and analysis of the topic (90.5% and 95.2%, respectively), work in small groups (57.1%), analysis of tests (85.7%), interactive training (81%), less often problem-oriented training (52.4%). At the same time, lectures are still read (33%), although this is not provided for in the residency programme.

Fully 95.2% agree that this survey will be useful for developing recommendations for improving the university and master's degree programmes, 4.8% partially agree with this.

Conclusions: The survey showed the presence of a healthy microclimate in the organization, as well as the fact that the majority of the interviewed teachers are satisfied with the organization of the educational process, the attitude of the management to the teachers of the institute, however, the respondents are not entirely satisfied with the previous level of preparation of applicants for admission to the residency programme. At the same time, areas for improvement were identified: professional development of teachers in pedagogy, methods of teaching in residency.

The results of the questionnaire are presented in the Attachment and generally demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the presence of a centralized management of educational programmes.

Conclusion on the basis of the external evaluation:

The members of the EEC carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the accredited educational program. The information obtained by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, the preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, the implementation of the activities of the KIED visit program from May 12 to 13, 2021 is analyzed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, the information was validated for each criterion of accreditation standards and the indicators of the annex to the self-assessment report were verified, which allowed us to verify the reliability of the information provided by KIED and supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme KIED described his real educational practice in postgraduate education. Before the visit to the organization, by studying the attachments to the report provided by the department of postgraduate education and access to Google Disk, experts reviewed more than 30 documents, as well as during an external expert evaluation by members of the EEC studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan until 2023, teaching materials of disciplines, syllabuses, control and measuring instruments, checklists, portfolio of residents, individual plans of residents for the 2019-2020 academic year, publications of teachers, rules for admission to residency, personnel policy, internal programme quality assurance systems, resources for training were viewed directly at the clinical bases of departments (classrooms, office equipment available for residents to work with literature, patient documentation, educational and methodological literature), resources on residency on the website www.eyeinst.kz, which made it possible to identify the compliance of the educational organization's activities with the basic accreditation standards, at the same time, the site does not have a section dedicated to residency programmes (educational programmes, class schedule, admission requirements, etc.).

During the external examination, it was found that the Rules for the training of medical personnel in residency were observed (order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 No. KR DSM-16). The volume of the study load and treatment and prophylactic work by sections of the educational programme is determined by the individual work plan of the resident (clause 14) for one year and is monitored by monthly reports of the resident in an arbitrary form. The accounting of completed tasks is drawn up in the form of a portfolio according to the recommendations in the syllabus.

In connection with the new edition of order No. 647 On the approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21.No. KR DSM-12/2020 Chapter 2. Requirements for the content of residency educational programmes with a focus on learning outcomes), there have been changes and additions in the educational programme in relation to the development of the research competence of residents, which must participate in the work of the research team.

In accordance with Article 222 of the Residency of Clause 4 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan on People's Health and the Health care System No. 360-VI ZRK dated July 7, 2020, external experts studied the activities and conducted conversations with mentors of residents, and it was established that each resident was provided with a mentor.

The experts took into account the fact that the accredited educational programme for the current state educational standard is being implemented for 3 academic years, therefore, at this time there is no graduation of students, nevertheless, the entire educational, methodological, personnel and resource base has been assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and interviews with students, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development, evaluation of educational programmes, decision-making on a number of key issues in the selection of

clinical sites, topics of electives, participation in the appeal commissions for the admission and evaluation of residents, the development of the content of individual plans of residents and choosing mentors.

At the same time, this substantiated the need for inclusion in post-accreditation monitoring, along with the implementation of the EEC recommendations, an analysis of the implementation of the criteria of Standard 9, an annual report on the contingent of students.

Recommendations for improving the institutional activities of the institute for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of an expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management on May 13, 2021.

The programme of preliminary online assessment of reports, study of the documentation on googledisk and a 2-day visit (12-14.05.2021) of the external expert assessment of the EEC were completed in full. On the part of the KIED team, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the residency programme in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of the medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of those responsible for postgraduate education of KIED employees, employees of clinical departments, a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of KIED and an overview of the strengths for each standard

Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

The mission is aimed at "training competitive, innovative-minded and patriotically educated specialists who meet modern domestic and international criteria, creating an elite scientific-intellectual and information-cultural environment in the Republic of Kazakhstan, contributing to its all-round economic growth and prosperity."

Taking into account the change in the status of KIED and the developed Strategic Plan for 2020-2025, it is planned to update and edit the mission of the Institute in its educational part in 2021. The mission of the institute, including its educational part, was brought to the attention of all KIED employees, residents, by posting on the KIED website (www.eyEinst.kz).

Institutional autonomy has been introduced in KIED. Academic freedom implies the independence of the development and implementation of both EP, within the framework of standard curricula, SCES (order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 647), and PDE programmes. Freedom in drafting programmes is achieved when describing syllabuses, IEP, RUP, the form, structure and order of development of which is determined by the DPE independently. The selection / selection of teachers is carried out in accordance with the "KIED LLP Human Resource Management Programme" (order No. 47-s of 12.09.2019).

The strategy for finding and hiring employees for full-time vacancies is ensured by the procedure for considering candidates and approving them in positions, the availability of employment contracts, an assessment of the quality of performance of labor duties during the trial period on the basis of the "Regulations on the Department of Postgraduate Education", job descriptions of the teaching staff.

The relationship between KIED and the student is regulated ["By the rules of the internal order"](#) and a contract for the provision of educational services, which is concluded with each student upon enrollment. The "Rules" detail the rights and obligations

In the residency programme "Ophthalmology, including children's", developed within the framework of the State Standard of Education (order 647 as revised in 2020) and the Qualification characteristics of health care workers according to (Pr. MoH RK No. 791 dated November 26, 2009)

as amended by the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan from 19.12.2018 No. KR DSM-43 the main final results of the resident's training are taken into account. When teaching, it is specifically paid attention on compliance with the norms of behavior and The Code of Honor of Students and the Code of Honor of the Teacher, approved on September 16, 2020

Thus, during a visit to KIED, experts established compliance with the basic criteria of the accreditation standard: the presence of a mission, strategic objectives of the programme, participation in the development of the mission of stakeholders (employees, teachers, residents' assets), residents are informed about their final results from the first day of classes, provided with resources and a practice-oriented educational programme. The effectiveness of the educational programme is evidenced by 100% employment.

Strengths:

1. KIED is a school with extensive experience in postgraduate education in ophthalmology since 1933;
2. Wide geography of country and international cooperation, ensuring the implementation of the educational programme based on the best world experience;
3. The strategy of innovative development and the transfer of technologies for the provision of medical care to the regions of the Republic (the presence of KIED branches).

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 16 standards conform: completely - 16, significantly 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 1: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) To intensify the work on introducing innovations into the educational process.
- 2) To involve more stakeholders in the implementation of postgraduate education.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES

The educational process is organized in accordance with the "Rules for organizing the educational process on credit technology of training" (order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 152 dated 20.04.2011). A credit-modular system and an integrated training approach are used in the training of residents. A model of residents' competence has been developed, prescribed in the EP approved at the meeting of the SC (protocol No. 2 of 02.04.2019). When drawing up the learning trajectory, the sequence of passing modules/disciplines is observed, taking into account pre- and post-requirements, the content of which is aimed at achieving knowledge, skills and abilities, providing a step-by-step approach to their study.

Persons who have completed training and successfully passed the final certification are awarded the qualification "ophthalmologist" and a certificate of completion of residency is issued

Practical training includes the daily personal participation of the student in medical activities using methods of diagnosis and treatment based on evidence-based medicine; mastering the practical skills provided by the training programme; work to promote a healthy lifestyle.

Resident training methods include: seminars, webinars, conferences, writing assignment (Essays), clinical walk-through, case studies, problem-based learning (PBL); Case-Based Learning (CBL), Team-Based Learning (TBL); simulation-based teaching, role play, brainstorming, group discussion method, portfolio, combination survey, small group teaching method, simulation technology, presentations.

Clinical mentors, according to [Guidebook](#) are employees of public health institutions and doctors of practical health care.

The resident represents the ability for continuous professional growth of the student, representing the totality of individual educational achievements in the form of a "Portfolio". Control over the design of the portfolio, verification of the authenticity of documents is carried out by the curator (mentor) of the group.

The training programme for residents provides for the implementation of various forms of educational and research work (preparation of messages, reports, research, publication of scientific

articles, poster reports, participation in scientific and practical conferences, etc.), taking into account the personal interests of students.

The Council of Young Scientists of KIED promotes the involvement of residents and young employees in research work. In the journal "Ophthalmological Journal of Kazakhstan" published by KIED, residents can publish scientific articles free of charge ([OJK No. 1-2, 2019](#)).

KIED has a clinical base that allows the student to get maximum access to patients in their profile of the PDE programme. The main clinical base is the head branch of KIED (Almaty) / chief physician E.G. Kanafyanova, doctor of medical sciences, doctor of the highest category, and a branch of KIED (Nursultan) / director Tuletova A.S., Ph. MD, doctor of the highest category.

Development and evaluation PDE programmes in the areas of training are carried out by the EMC, reviewed by representatives of practical health care (employers) and approved by the CA of KIED. From the 2021-2022 academic year, it is planned to include a resident of 2-3 years of study in the EMC.

According to the implementation of the project "Modernization of medical education and science" dated 03.03.2017, in pursuance of the Action Plan for solving problematic issues in the activities of medical education organizations, approved by the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.08.2017, a medical organization can send a letter of desire to the head of KIED train a resident at this clinical base So, in accordance with this document, in KIED, 4 resident ophthalmologists from [Karaganda Medical University](#)...

Thus, during a visit to KIED, experts established compliance with the basic criteria of the accreditation standard: a developed and approved educational programme that meets the requirements of the State Educational Standard of Education 2019 and is implemented in a student-centered and patient-centered environment in the best clinics of the city. The educational programme is provided with appropriate methodological documentation and documents accompanying residents (guidebook, Codex, Portfolio structure, EMCD, syllabuses). Teachers have introduced and effectively apply various teaching methods, mainly of a practical nature, and involve residents in research, which contributes to the formation and development of competencies in the specialty.

Strengths:

1. Flexibility in the implementation of the educational programme;
2. Taking into account the needs of practical health care in the development of electives;
3. Patient orientation and safety of the learning environment (certified and accredited clinics);
4. Using innovative teaching methods to build clinical skills;

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 23 standards conform: completely -23, significantly -0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 2: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

No recommendation

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES

The student assessment policy is defined by "Academic Policy "for the 2020-2021 academic year (minutes of September 16, 2020) and the Educational Programme (minutes of September 16, 2020).

The assessment of the educational achievements of residents is carried out on the basis of indicators of the level of competence in various forms: an interview, control questions, tasks in test form (MCQ tasks with several options of correct answers), a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations. KIED LLP uses an additional method of assessing the work of residents - portfolio assessment. The portfolio assessment is carried out on the basis of the developed by the DPE and the assessment sheet approved at the meeting of the SC

Reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods are defined in the syllabus.

The examination of EP and CIS is carried out by trained, competent teaching staff: "Teacher of medical organizations of education and science", Gabbasova A. A. (2017), "Organization and conduct of scientific research in health care", Doctor of Medical Sciences Stepanova I. S. (2019), "Methodology

for the development and examination of multiple choice test questions (MCQ)" Candidate of Medical Sciences Abdullina V. R (2019).

Strengths:

1. Availability of material and technical base for the implementation of the educational programme;

2. Trained and competent faculty

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. conform out of 11 standards: completely - 0, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 3: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

No recommendation

Standard 4: STUDENTS

KIED successfully implements the main task - it is professional orientation and career planning of a resident, increasing the mobility, competitiveness of graduates in the labor market, expanding the framework of social partnership and improving the system "resident-educational organization-employer". Residents are trained according to an individual plan. Under the supervision of doctors (mentors) of the clinic, it is allowed to supervise patients and on duty. The IEP is formed for each academic year on the basis of the WC approved for the corresponding academic year and the catalog of elective disciplines.

Strengths:

1 Availability of residents to patients at all levels of providing medical and diagnostic assistance to the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan with diseases of the organs of vision.

2. The possibility of self-realization of a student not only in educational trajectory and in scientific activity

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 28 standards conform: completely - 27, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 4: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

1) Involve residents more widely in the work of consultative, advisory and collegial bodies;

2) Promote wider participation of residents and teachers in international and republican educational and professional events, as well as consider the possibility of implementing a programme of academic mobility of teachers and residents;

3) Involve residents more widely in the work of advisory and collegial bodies.

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY

The policy of recruiting and accepting teachers, managers and mentors, the assessment of the activities of teachers and mentors are determined by the regulatory legal acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan by the Charter. Strategic development plan of KIED LLP and the "Human Resource Management Programme" (order No. 47-s dated 09/12/2019).

The human resources management department annually carefully monitors the advanced training of teaching staff. The plan for advanced training is approved by the Director general of KIED LLP, the financial and economic department and at the expense of the institution once every 5 years (108 or 216 hours) - under the programme 067, under the programme 006 and from extra-budgetary funds, employees undergo training. If desired, employees and teachers can go through training courses at their own expense. 5 employees of the teaching staff underwent advanced training in the countries of near and far abroad at the expense of the Ministry of Defense.

Over 5 years in KIED LLP, 21 people and 3, in educational activities, underwent advanced training in their specialty.

The personnel policy of KIED LLP is determined by the development of employees, support of teachers, their training for further professional growth of professional and pedagogical qualifications and is guaranteed by the Director general of KIED LLP and monitoring by the Human Resources Management Department.

So, the work of the teaching staff was marked with letters of commendation and letters of gratitude from KIED LLP, including 4 staff members of the teaching staff were awarded the title "Honorary Professor": Dr. med. Beisenbaeva B.S., MD Stepanova I.S. (2018), MD Aldasheva N.A., MD Suleimenov m.S. (2019), the title of Honorary Associate Professor - Ph.D. Abdullina V.R. (2019).

Strengths:

1. Transparency and accessibility of KIED LLP policy management;
2. Opportunity for career growth of teaching staff and employees of KIED LLP.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 7 standards conform: completely -5, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 5: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Develop and approve a mentoring regulation;
- 2) Conduct professional development of teaching staff in pedagogical competencies.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

The developed material and technical base of KIED LLP (located in the cities of Almaty (6941 sq. m., Astana (3156.8 sq. m.) And Shymkent), its constant modernization provides great opportunities for theoretical, practical training of residents. Access to the latest professional literature and sources, adequate information and communication technologies and equipment and a safe environment for self-education. The library fund has 9407 copies, of which 5323 are specialized literature (books, dissertations, abstracts, periodicals). The library fund has been updated on average by 13.5 % In the state language - 91 literary sources (1.6%).

Implementation of the acquired knowledge, scientific foundations and methodology of scientific research through direct participation in projects, publications of research results, oral and poster reports at scientific conferences. In 2020, at an international conference at the Scientific Center of Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery, a resident of KIDE LLP for 3 years of training, K. Tukeshev took 3rd place for a poster report. Resident Ruslanuly K., 2 years of training together with clinical mentors Orazbekov L. N. submitted an article to the journal with a high impact factor.

Strengths:

1. Safe learning environment.
2. Access to web and electronic media.
3. Stimulating the scientific activity of teaching staff (payment for articles with a high impact factor, participation in grants).

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 21 standards conform: fully - 16, significantly - 5, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 6: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Information about the research activities of residents should be drawn up in the form of a report;
- 2) To intensify the scientific activities of the teaching staff (acts of implementation, textbooks on topics);
- 3) Place an educational portal on the organization's website with appropriate protection;
- 4) Create a test center based on a computer class;
- 5) Purchase and use an anti-plagiarism programme.

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

Multilevel monitoring of the educational process at the level residency and additional education (CPD), external and internal expert evaluation, employer recall, discussion at a meeting of the EMC and approval at a meeting of the Academic Council of KIED LLP. Independent monitoring of graduates of residency through the National Center for Independent Examination (NCIE) and employers' survey.

Admission policy and needs assessment in the health care system, implementation of programmes through the website of the electronic labor exchange enbek.kz, bilateral and tripartite agreements. Involvement of employers in the development and discussion of educational programmes. Formation of advanced training cycles on requests and proposals from regional specialists with an emphasis on innovations in the field of diagnostics and treatment and updating of clinical protocols.

Strengths:

1. Multilevel monitoring
2. Participation of stakeholders in the evaluation of the programme and monitoring the quality of the educational programme

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 13 standards conform: completely - 0, significantly - 0, partially - 0 do not correspond - 0

Standard 7: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) *Systematically monitor the quality and compliance of clinical bases, material and technical equipment and other educational resources with the goals and objectives of the educational programme.*

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

When managing the educational program of the residency, KIED is guided by the "Academic Policy". Control and monitoring of the implementation of the residency program in the specialty "Ophthalmology, including children's" is carried out by the DPE. Transparency of EP management and decision-making is guaranteed. The DPE is financed from the grant funding of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (program 006) and extra-budgetary funds (target residency, paid residency, paid PDC). The cost of training in the KIED residency is 815,600 tenge and has not changed since 2016. The KIED Supervisory Board is provided with a report on financial and economic activities for the year, in accordance with the National Financial Reporting Standard No. 2. in the context of state programs and income from paid services (purchase of goods, equipment, purchase of educational and methodological literature, uninterrupted operation of the Internet and WIFI on the territory of the institute).

Strengths:

1. Transparency of management and administration
2. Availability of training on a paid basis based on the price-quality principle.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 19 standards conform: completely - 0, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 8: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) *To increase the item of expenditure on professional development of teaching staff.*
- 2) *To increase the number of scientific research with the commercialization of the scientific achievements of the institute.*
- 3) *Ensure digitalization of the educational process.*
- 4) *Systematize the work of LEC and document all procedures.*

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

KIED implements postgraduate training with the involvement of stakeholders with constant updating of the educational programme, structure, content, learning outcomes / competencies, assessment of knowledge and skills, learning environment, in accordance with the additions and

changes in the current regulations of the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Practicing and improving the practical skills of students is carried out in the Simulation room and WETLAB (center for practicing microsurgery skills).

The indicator of continuous improvement of the educational process is 100%, employment of graduates in five years (2017-2020). At KIED LLP, generational continuity is respected. The teaching methods and approaches were adapted, adjusted with the structure of the content and duration of the EP in accordance with the achievements of KIED LLP and the requirements of socio-economic and cultural conditions.

Strengths:

1. Continuous educational process theory-practice and continuity of generation.
2. Continuous improvement of the educational process.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 4 standards conform: completely - 0, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 9: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

No recommendation

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and carrying out the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

5. Recommendations for institutional improvement of LLP "" Kazakh Order "Badge of Honor" Scientific Research Institute of Eye Diseases ":

Standard 1

1. To intensify the work on introducing innovations into the educational process.
2. To involve more stakeholders in the implementation of postgraduate education.

Standard 4

3. Involve residents more widely in the work of advisory and collegial bodies.
4. Promote wider participation of residents and teachers in international and republican educational and professional events, as well as consider the possibility of implementing a programme for academic mobility of teachers and residents.
5. Involve residents more widely in the work of advisory and collegial bodies.

Standard 5

6. Develop and approve a mentoring regulation;
7. Conduct professional development of teaching staff in pedagogical competencies.

Standard 6

8. Information about the research activities of residents should be drawn up in the form of a report.
9. To intensify the scientific activity of the teaching staff (acts of implementation, textbooks on topics).
10. Place an educational portal on the organization's website with appropriate protection.
11. Create a test center based on a computer class.
12. Purchase and use an anti-plagiarism programme.

Standard 7

13. Systematically monitor the quality and compliance of clinical bases, material and technical equipment and other educational resources with the goals and objectives of the educational programme.

Standard 8

14. To increase the item of expenditures for professional development of teaching staff.
15. To increase the number of scientific research with the commercialization of the scientific achievements of the institute.
16. Ensure digitalization of the educational process.
17. Systematize the work of LEC and document all procedures.

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous decision to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the Limited Liability Company "Kazakh Order" Badge of Honor "" Research Institute of Eye Diseases "for a period of 5 years.

Chairperson

Zhanteleeva Lyazzat Asanova

Foreign expert

Zakirova Guzel Zakirovna

Academic expert

Zhankalova Zulfiya Meyrkhanovna

Academic expert

Semenova Yulia Mikhailovna

Representative of practical healthcare

Kalibekova Gulnara Zarkynbekovna

Resident Representative

Imadieva Aisholpan

ECAQA Observer

Sarsenbayeva Dariyabanu Bulatovna



Institutional Quality Profile and KIED External Evaluation Criteria (Summary)

Standard	Criteria for evaluation Number of standards	Assessment			
		Totally coincides	Significantly corresponds	Partially compliant	Does not match
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES 16	14	2	-	-
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 23	23	-	-	-
3.	ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES 11	11	-	-	-
4.	STUDENTS 28	27	1	-	-
5.	ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY 7	5	2	-	-
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES 20	16	5	-	-
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION 13	13	-	-	-
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION 19	19	-	-	-
9	CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT 4	4	-	-	-
	Total: 141 criteria	132	10	-	-
		142			

* BS - the basic standard must be fulfilled by each medical educational organization, and the fulfillment must be demonstrated during an external assessment of the medical educational and scientific organization.

List of documents studied by EEC members within the framework of accreditation

No.	Names of documents	number	Date of approval (if applicable)
1.	State license of the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 06, 2011 No. 0142684 license No. KZ33LAA00016970 dated September 13, 2019.	1	September 13, 2019.
2.	Accreditation certificate No. KZ44VEG00001428 dated 2.12.2014. accreditation of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Committee for Control of Medical and Pharmaceutical Activities	1	2.12.2014
3.	Certificate IA No. 01 to the institutional and Certificate SA No. 001 on the formalized accreditation at the Independent Kazakhstani Agency for Quality Assurance in Education.	2	2016
4.	State registration certificates, KIED status changed to LLP - limited partnership...	1	08/16/2019
5.	Certificate (Series MK No. 006191 dated 06/25/2020.) accredited by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan as a subject of scientific and scientific and technical activities	1	06/25/2020
6.	Organizational structure of KIED	1	Without date
7.	"Ophthalmological Journal of Kazakhstan" (OJK)	5	Journals for 3 years
8.	"Inner order rules	1	From 16.09. US protocol No. 5
9.	Student Code of Honor and Teacher Code of Honor	1	From 11.09.2015, protocol US No. 6
10.	Educational programme of the specialty	1	09/16/2020
11.	Rules for organizing the educational process in KIED LLP	1	09/16/20920
12.	Reference guide	1	09/16/2020
13.	Within the framework of the academic. mobility KIED, 4 resident ophthalmologists from Karaganda Medical University...	1	Order No. 27 of 01/31/2019.
14.	Academic policy	1	09/16/20920
15.	Academic calendar	1	
16.	Regulations on academic mobility	1	09/16/20920
17.	Intermediate attestations of residents	1	Order on conducting IA of residents No. 47-p dated 15.01.2021.
18.	Checklists	7	
19.	Resident portfolio	1	

20.	Human Resource Management Programme "KIED LLP"		Order No. 47- dated 09/12/2019
21.	Strategic development plan of KIED LLP for 2019-2021.	1	From 14.06.2019
22.	Participation of residents in research projects	1	List for 5 years
23.	The best reports of scientific research of residents were awarded with diplomas	1	05/16/2018
24.	Memorandum of Cooperation from Asfendiyarov KazNMU	1	No. 489/1208 of 28.12.2018
25.	A continuing education plan as doctors and nurses...	1	27.01.2021
26.	Syllabus for residents of 1 year of study in disciplines: "Outpatient ophthalmology" -1; Ophthalmology in hospital 1 and 2. For 2 years of study in the disciplines: "Ophthalmology outpatient clinic" -2; Ophthalmology in hospital 3 and 4	6	09/16/2020, minutes No. 5
27.	schedule	4	09/16/2020, minutes No. 5
28.	Working curriculum	6	09/16/2020, minutes No. 5
29.	Journal of progress in the discipline: "Outpatient Ophthalmology" -1 "	1	01/06/2021
30.	Examination sheet for the discipline: "Outpatient ophthalmology" -1 "	1	01/06/2021